

BORALASYN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10082793 0

# CASES AND MATERIALS

## ON

# CRIMINAL LAW

Edited by

**R. S. MACKAY**

Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto  
Toronto

1958

Storage  
KE  
8808.5  
.M33  
1958





TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I	PURPOSE OF CRIMINAL LAW	
	R. v. Jones, 115 Can. C.C. 273	1
	R. v. Sinnisiak, unreptd.	4
	Crime Prevention and Judicial Casuistry	5
CHAPTER II	CRIMINAL LIABILITY AND THE "GUILTY ACT"	
(A)	<u>Nature of an Act</u>	
	R. v. Charlson, [1955] 1 All E.R. 859	8
	Fain v. Commonwealth, 78 Ky. 183	13
	R. v. Larsonneur, 149 L.T. 542	17
	Slattery v. Haley, 52 O.L.R. 95	18
	R. v. Shaw, 70 Can. C.C. 159	19
(B)	<u>The Nature of Mens Rea; The Problem of Statutory Interpretation.</u>	
	R. v. Tolson, 16 Cox C.C. 629	20
	The Queen v. Prince, L.R. 2 C.C.R. 154	31
	R. v. Rees, 115 Can. C.C. 1	35
	R. v. McLeod, 111 Can. C.C. 106	40
(C)	<u>Mens Rea of Intention</u>	
	The Queen v. Martin, 8 Q.B.D. 54	46
	R. v. Welch, 1 Q.B.D. 23	48
	R. v. Harris & Atkins, 15 Cox C.C. 75	49
	Studstill v. State, 7 Ga. 2	50
	R. v. Steane, [1947] 1 All E.R. 813	50
	Thabo Meli v. R., [1954] 1 All E.R. 373	53
	R. v. Machekequonabe, 28 O.R. 309	54
(D)	<u>Mens Rea of Recklessness; Herein of Criminal Negligence.</u>	
	R. v. Benge, 176 E.R. 665	56
	People v. Clemente, 130 N.Y.S. 612	57
	Akerle v. R., [1943] A.C. 255	58
	Commonwealth v. Bouvier, 55 N.E. (2d.) 913	59
	R. v. Baker, 51 Can. C.C. 60	60
	Andrews v. D.P.P., [1937] A.C. 576	64
	R. v. Nickle, 34 Can. C.C. 15	67
	People v. John Dunleavy, [1948] I.R. 95	70
	Commonwealth v. Welansky, 55 N.E. (2d.) 902	74
	People v. Young, 129 P. (2d.) 353	80
	R. v. Dant, 169 E.R. 1517	82
	R. v. Finney, 12 Cox C.C. 625	83
	R. v. Gagnon, 115 Can. C.C. 82	84
	R. v. Markuss, 176 E.R. 598	86
(E)	<u>Proof of Mens Rea</u>	
	Commonwealth v. Pierce, 138 Mass. 165	87
	R. v. Burdee, 12 Cr. App. R. 153	90
	R. v. Ward, 40 Cr. App. R. 1	92
	R. v. Stones, 56 St. Rep. 25	94
	Moreland, The Law of Homicide	97
	R. v. Wagstaffe, 10 Cox C.C. 530	98
	R. v. Grout, 172 E.R. 1394	100
	Wilson v. Inyang [1951] 2 K.B. 799	101
	R. v. Reece, 109 Can. C.C. 26	103
	R. v. Piggly Wiggly Canadian Ltd., 60 Can. C.C. 104	106
	Reynolds v. G.H. Austin, [1951] 1 All E.R. 606	110
	R. v. Hawinda Taverns Ltd., 112 Can. C.C. 301	113
	Allan v. Whitehead, [1930] 1 K.B. 211	118
	Sayre, Public Welfare Offenses	120
	R. v. Ford, 12 Can. C.C. 555	123
	Woolmington v. D.P.P., [1935] A.C. 462	123
	R. v. Macklin, 2 Lew. C.C. 225	125
	R. v. Giannotti, 115 Can. C.C. 203	126

## CHAPTER III THE PROBLEM OF JUSTIFICATION

(A) <u>Protection of Life and Limb</u>	
People v. Hecker, 42 P.	307 132
R. v. Ogal, 50 Can. C.C.	71 134
R. v. Dunham, 95 Can. C.C.	317 135
R. v. Rose, 15 Cox C.C.	136
R. v. Scott, 15 Can. C.C.	442 138
R. v. Moke, 28 Can. C.C.	296 139
R. v. Hussey, 18 Cr. App. R.	160 140
State v. Goode, 195 S.W.	1006 141
R. v. Dudley and Stephens, 14 Q.B.D.	273 142
U.S. v. Holmes, 26 Fed. Cas.	360 147
R. v. Bourne, [1938] 3 All E.R.	615 148
R. v. Simpson, 84 L.J.K.B.	1893 151
People v. Roberts, 178 N.W.	690 152
Repouille v. U.S., 165 Fed. (2d.)	1952 152
State v. Nargasian, 58 Atl.	953 153
Dunbar v. The King, 67 Can. C.C.	20 155
(B) <u>Protection of Property</u>	
R. v. Ryan, 116 Can. C.C.	239 156
People v. Smith, 88 N.E. (2d.)	444 156
Carroll v. Commonwealth, 299 S.W.	183 157
People v. Eatman, 91 N.E. (2d.)	387 159
Bangren v. State, 17 So. (2d.)	599 160
(C) <u>Prevention of Crime and Apprehension of Criminals</u>	
R. v. Hastings, 90 Can. C.C.	150 162
Koechlin v. Waugh, 118 Can. C.C.	24 166
R. ex rel. A.-G. Can. v. Sandford, 118 Can. C.C.	93 169
Proceedings of American Law Institute	174
(D) <u>Superior Orders</u>	
R. v. Smith, 17 S.C.R. (Cape Colony)	561 175
State v. Roy, 64 S.E. (2d.)	840 176
U.S. v. Von Leeb [Nuremberg Trials]	176
(E) <u>Provocation</u>	
Bedder v. D.P.P., [1954] 2 All E.R.	801 178
R. v. Lesbini, 11 Cr. App. R.	7 181
R. v. Alexander, 9 Cr. App. R.	140 183
Fisher v. U.S., 328 U.S.	403 183
R. v. McCarthy, 38 Cr. App. R.	74 186
R. v. Gauthier, 29 Cr. App. R.	113 189
R. v. Linton, 93 Can. C.C.	97 191
Taylor v. The King, 89 Can. C.C.	209 191
R. v. Smith, 176 E.R.	910 198
R. v. Krawchuk, 75 Can. C.C.	16 198
R. v. Gorczak, 103 Can. C.C.	82 200
R. v. Duffy, [1949] 1 All E.R.	932 200
R. v. Tripodi, 112 Can. C.C.	66 201
Scroggs v. State, 93 S.E. (2d.)	583 206
R. v. Harrington, 10 Cox C.C.	370 207
Dixon v. State, 289 S.W.	46 208
R. v. Manchuk, 68 Can. C.C.	362 208
R. v. Jackson, 75 Can. C.C.	306 212
R. v. Gross, 23 Cox C.C.	455 216

## CHAPTER IV THE PROBLEM OF OMISSIONS

Commonwealth v. Cali, 141 N.E.	510 217
India Law Commissioners - Penal Code	217
Ames, Law and Morals	219
People v. Beardsley, 113 N.W.	1128 220
R. v. Russell, [1932] Vict. L.R.	59 223
R. v. Lewis, 7 Can. C.C.	261 225
R. v. Mabbet, 5 Cox C.C.	339 228
R. Gibbons & Proctor, 13 Cr. App. R.	134 228
R. v. Sidney, 20 Can. C.C.	376 229
R. v. Bonnyman, 28 Cr. App. R.	131 231
R. v. Chattaway, 17 Cr. App. R.	7 232

R. v. Shepherd, 31 L.J.M.C. 102	232
R. v. Izod, 20 Cox. C.C. 690	233
R. v. Hall, 14 Cr. App. r. 58	234
R. v. Pittwood, 19 T.L.R. 37	235
R. v. Hurt, 55 O.L.R. 48	235

## CHAPTER V

## THE PROBLEM OF CAUSATION

R. v. Bennett, 8 Cox C.C. 74	236
R. v. Clucas, [1949] 2 All E.R. 40	238
R. v. Davis & Wagstaffe, 15 Cox C.C. 174	239
State v. Snider, 94 S.E. 981	240
R. v. Godin, 71 Can. C.C. 262	241
People v. Fowler, 174 P. 892	242
R. v. Michael, 173 E.R. 867	244
State v. Angelina, 81 S.E. 141	244
People v. Lewis, 57 P. 470	246
R. v. Beech, 23 Cox C.C. 181	249
R. v. Pitts, 174 E.R. 509	249
R. v. Kissick, 69 Can. C.C. 403	250
R. v. Holland, 174 E.R. 313	251

## CHAPTER VI

SELECTED OFFENCES AND PROBLEMS RELATED TO  
LIFE AND LIMB(A) Murder

R. v. Saunders & Archer, Fosters Crown Law 371	252
R. v. Hopwood, 8 Cr. App. R. 143	252
R. v. Hughes, 78 Can. C.C. 257	252
R. v. Serné, 16 Cox C.C. 311	256
Rowe v. The King, 100 Can. C.C. 97	258
R. v. Betts & Ridley, 22 Cr. App. R. 148	266
R. v. Jarmain, [1946] K.B. 74	268
People v. Cabaltero, 87 P. (2d.) 364	271
R. v. Fitton, 115 Can. C.C. 225	274
Commonwealth v. Moore, 88 S.W. 1085	276
Commonwealth v. Thomas, 117 Atl. (2d.) 204	277
Cathro v. The Queen, 113 Can. C.C. 225	287
Chow Bew v. The Queen, 113 Can. C.C. 337	291
R. v. Eng Git Lee, 116 Can. C.C. 316	297
R. v. Guay & Guay, 117 Can. C.C. 174	300

(B) Assault(i) Rape

R. v. Miller, [1954] 2 All E.R. 529	305
R. v. Ram & Rame, 17 Cox C.C. 609	310
R. v. Bursey, 118 Can. C.C. 219	310
State v. Welch, 89 S.W. 945	315
R. v. Williams, [1923] 1 K.B. 340	316
R. v. Harms, 81 Can. C.C. 4	317

(ii) Carnal Knowledge

R. v. Johnston, 91 Can. C.C. 59	320
R. v. Wiberg, 113 Can. C.C. 257	322

(iii) Indecent Assault and Gross Indecency

R. v. Louie Chong, 23 Can. C.C. 250	324
R. v. Donovan, [1934] 2 K.B. 498	325

(iv) Common Assault

R. v. Judge, 118 Can. C.C. 410	328
State v. Wiley, 216 N.W. 866	329

(v) Aggravated Assault

R. v. Macdonald, 82 Can. C.C. 47	331
R. v. McLeod, 111 Can. C.C. 106	332
Monk v. Strathern, [1921] S.C. 4	332

## CHAPTER VII

## SELECTED OFFENCES AGAINST PROPERTY

(i) Theft(a) generally

First Report of Commissioners On Criminal Law	333
R. v. Cabbage, 168 E.R. 809	335
R. v. Harding, 21 Cr. App. R. 166	336



R. v. Taylor, [1911] 1 K.B. 674	337
Henderson v. Northwester Mutual Ins. Co., 43 Can. C.C. 217	338
Brochu v. The King, 10 C.R. 183	339
(b) theft by a trick	
R. v. Buckmaster, 20 Q.B.D. 182	341
R. v. Nicholson et al., 168 E.R. 407	342
R. v. Solomons, 17 Cox C.C. 93	343
R. v. Stewart, 1 Cox C.C. 174	344
(c) defences	
R. v. Ford, 12 Can. C.C. 555	345
R. v. Bernhard, [1938] 2 K.B. 264	345
(ii) <u>False Pretences</u>	
R. v. Hemingway, 112 Can. C.C. 321	349
R. v. Reid, 74 Can. C.C. 156	352
R. v. Kysant (Lord), [1932] 1 K.B. 442	359
R. v. Hutchinson, 71 Can. C.C. 199	363
R. v. Bryan, 26 L.J.M.M. 84	365
(iii) <u>"Receiving"</u>	
R. v. Van Dorn, 116 Can. C.C. 325	368
R. v. Dolan, 24 L.J.M.C. 59	370
R. v. Marabella, 117 Can. C.C. 78	371
R. v. Wiley, 20 L.J.M.C. 4	372
R. v. Sullivan & Godbolt, 85 Can. C.C. 349	374
R. v. Parker, 77 Can. C.C. 9	376
R. v. Morin, 118 Can. C.C. 108	376
(iv) <u>Robbery and Extortion</u>	380
Crankshaw's Cr. Code, 6th ed., p. 526	381
R. v. Boyle & Merchant, 10 Cr. App. R. 180	382
R. v. Pacholko, 75 Can. C.C. 172	383
Thorne v. Motor Trade Assoc., 26 Cr. App. R. 51	386
(v) <u>Arson</u>	
R. v. Jorgenson, 111 Can. C.C. 30	387

## CHAPTER VIII INCHOATE CRIMES: HEREIN OF ATTEMPTS, CONSPIRACY AND SOLICITATION

(A) <u>Attempts</u>	
R. v. Cline, 115 Can. C.C. 18	392
R. v. Goodman, 22 U.C.C.P. 338	396
R. v. Robinson, 11 Cr. App. R. 124	398
Report of Fire Commissioner (N.Y.)	400
Holmes, The Common Law, p. 68-9	401
People v. Miller, 42 P. (2d.) 308	401
R. v. Barker, [1924] N.Z.L.R. 865	402
Commonwealth v. Kennedy, 48 N.E. 770	406
Arnold, Criminal Attempts	407
R. v. Lyons, 16 Can. C.C. 152	408
Foster v. Commonwealth, 31 S.E. 503	410
(B) <u>Conspiracy</u>	
Martins Annotated Criminal Code (1955), p. 666	412
R. v. O'Brien, 110 Can. C.C. 1	413
R. v. McRae, 111 Can. C.C. 162	416
U.S. v. Falcone, 109 Fed. (2d.) 579	418
U.S. v. Bruno, 105 Fed. (2d.) 921	419
R. v. Meyrick & Ribuffi, 21 Cr. App. R. 94	420
R. v. Cameron, 64 Can. C.C. 224	422
R. v. Witchurch, 24 Q.B.D. 420	423
R. v. Whitaker, 10 Cr. App. R. 245	424
R. v. Robinson, 92 Can. C.C. 223	424
R. v. Howell, 176 E.R. 513	424
Commonwealth v. Donoghue, 63 S.W. (2d.) 3	425
McDonald v. U.S., 89 Fed. (2d.) 128	428
Eldredge v. U.S., 62 Fed. (2d.) 449	430
R. v. Sommers (No. 1), 26 W.W.R. (N.S.) 241	432
R. v. Sommers (No. 8), 26 W.W.R. (N.S.) 257	433

R. v. Container Materials Ltd., 74 Can. C.C. 113	434
Rose v. The King, 88 Can. C.C. 114	435
U.S. v. Dennis, 183 Fed. (2d.) 201	436
Holman, Evidence in Conspiracy Cases	436
Krulewitch v. U.S., 336 U.S. 440	437

(C) Counselling (Solicitation)

R. v. Gordon & Gordon, 79 Can. C.C. 315	439
R. v. Brown, 14 Eng. & Em. Dig. (1956), 118	441
R. v. Tyrrell, [1894] 1 Q.B. 710	441

## CHAPTER IX

## ACCESSORIES AND ACCOMPLICES

R. v. Harder, 114 Can. C.C. 129	442
R. v. Kravenia, 112 Can. C.C. 81	444
State v. Tally, 15 So. 722	445
R. v. Rhyno, 83 Can. C.C. 186	448
R. v. Halmo, 76 Can. C.C. 116	449
R. v. Cunningham, 68 Can. C.C. 176	452
R. v. Roy, 3 Can. C.C. 472	453
R. v. Bullock, [1955] 1 All E.R. 15	454
National Coal Board v. Gamble, [1958] 3 All E.R. 203	456
R. v. Coney, 8 Q.B.D. 534	460
R. ex rel Tomlinson v. Hayes, 79 Can. C.C. 358	463
Henderson v. The King, 91 Can. C.C. 97	463
R. v. Croft, 29 Cr. App. R. 169	466
Young v. The King, 98 Can. C.C. 195	467

## CHAPTER X

## LEGAL RESPONSIBILITY

(A) Insanity

Trial of Edward Arnold, 16 How. St. Tr. 695	469
R. v. Bellingham, Old Bailey, 1812	470
Daniel M'Naghten's Case, 8 E.R. 718	470
R. v. Codere, 12 Cr. App. R. 21	472
R. v. Windle, [1952] 2 Q.B. 826	476
People v. Schmidt, 110 N.E. 945	477
Stapleton v. The Queen, 86 C.L.R. 358	479
Royal Commission on Insanity (1956)	481
Durham v. U.S., 214 Fed. (2d.) 862	482
Royal Commission on Insanity (1956)	485
Royal Commission on Capital Punishment (1953)	487

(B) Ignorance

(i) superstition	487
(ii) mistake of fact	487
(iii) mistake of law	
R. v. Esop, 173 E.R. 203	487

(C) Drunkenness

D.P.P. v. Beard, [1920] A.C. 479	488
----------------------------------	-----

(D) Mental Deficiency

Kirkwood v. H.M. Advocate, [1939] S.C. 36	494
---	-----

(E) Youth

R. v. Smullin, 91 Can. C.C. 274	496
R. v. Ginnetti, 113 Can. C.C. 223	498

